

1 **BRYAN S. WESTERFELD (S.B.# 218253)**

bwesterfeld@calemployerlaw.com

2 **NICOLE E. WURSCHER (S.B.# 245879)**

nwurscher@calemployerlaw.com

3 **WALRAVEN & WESTERFELD LLP**

101 Enterprise, Suite 350

4 Aliso Viejo, California 92656

Telephone: (949) 215-1990

5 Facsimile: (949) 215-1999

6 **STEPHEN P. LUCKE (MN ID #151210)**

lucke.steve@dorsey.com

7 **RJ ZAYED (MN ID #0309849)**

zayed.rj@dorsey.com

8 **Admitted Pro hac vice**

DORSEY & WHITNEY LLP

9 50 South Sixth Street, Suite 1500

Minneapolis, MN 55402-1498

10 Telephone: (612) 340-2600

Facsimile: (612) 340-2868

11 Attorneys for Defendants and Counter-Plaintiffs

UnitedHealth Group, Inc.;

12 United Healthcare Services, Inc., UnitedHealthcare

Insurance Company; OptumInsight, Inc.

14 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

15 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA, WESTERN DIVISION

16 ALMONT AMBULATORY SURGERY
17 CENTER, LLC, a California limited
18 liability company; et al.,
Plaintiffs,

19 vs.

20 UNITEDHEALTH GROUP, INC.; et al.,
21 Defendants.

22 UNITED HEALTHCARE SERVICES,
23 INC., UNITED HEALTHCARE
INSURANCE COMPANY;
24 OPTUMINSIGHT, INC.,
25 Counter-Plaintiffs,

26 vs.

27 ALMONT AMBULATORY SURGERY
28 CENTER, LLC, a California limited
liability company, et al.,

Case No. CV14-3053 MWF (VBKx)

**UNOPPOSED EX PARTE
APPLICATION TO FILE
UNREDACTED COPY OF SECOND
AMENDED COUNTERCLAIM
UNDER SEAL PURSUANT TO
LOCAL RULE 79-5.1**

Judge: Hon. Michael W. Fitzgerald

Magistrate Judge: Hon. Victor B. Kenton

Trial Date: None Set

1 Counter-Defendants.

2
3 Pursuant to Local Rule 79-5.1, Counterclaim Plaintiffs UNITED
4 HEALTHCARE SERVICES, INC., UNITED HEALTHCARE INSURANCE
5 COMPANY, and OPTUMINSIGHT, INC. (together, "United") hereby apply to this
6 Court for an Order to file under seal an unredacted copy of the Second Amended
7 Counterclaim ("SACC"), complete with unredacted copies of all appendices and
8 exhibits.

9 United filed the SACC on April 30, 2015 (dkt. 152). The SACC and its
10 appendices and exhibits contain an extensive amount of sensitive Protected Health
11 Information ("PHI") protected by the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability
12 Act ("HIPAA"), Pub. L. 104-191 (1996), which was redacted in the version filed with
13 the Court (dkt. 152). On May 1, 2015, counsel for United provided counsel for
14 Counterclaim Defendants an unredacted copy of the SACC pursuant to Local Rule 5.2-
15 1. On June 17, 2015, counsel for Counterclaim Defendants notified counsel for United
16 that they believed an unredacted SACC should have been filed with the Court under
17 seal.

18 Good cause exists to allow the filing of the unredacted version of the SACC
19 under seal because it contains confidential medical information, and the need to protect
20 medical privacy is a "compelling reason" justifying filing a document under seal, *see*
21 *Karpenski v. Am. Gen. Life Cos., LLC*, No. 2:12-cv-01569RSM, 2013 WL 5588312, at
22 *1 (W.D. Wash. 2013) ("The need to protect medical privacy qualifies in general as a
23 'compelling reason' [to file under seal]."); *G. v. Hawaii*, Nos. 08-00551 ACK-BMK,
24 09-00044 ACK-BMK, 2010 WL 2607483, at *1 (D. Haw. June 25, 2010) (same);
25 *Abbey v. Hawaii Employers Mut. Ins. Co.*, No. 09-000545 SOM/BMK, 2010 WL
26 4715793, at *1 (D. Haw. Nov. 15, 2010) (same); *Lombardi v. TriWest Healthcare*
27 *Alliance Corp.*, No. CV-08-02381-PHX-FJM, 2009 WL 1212170, at *1 (D. Ariz.

1 May 4, 2009) (same); *Johansen v. S.D. Police Dep't*, No. 07cv1601-LAB (LSP), 2008
 2 WL 170016, at *1 (S.D. Cal. Jan. 17, 2008) (same); *see also Skinner v. Ashan*, No. CV
 3 04-2380, 2007 WL 708972, at *2 (D.N.J. Mar. 2, 2007) (observing that medical
 4 records “have long been recognized as confidential in nature”).

5 Counsel for United notified counsel for Counterclaim Defendants, Daron Toooh,
 6 Eric Chan, Charles Kreindler, and Barbara Taylor that they would be making this
 7 application. Counsel for Counterclaim Defendants do not oppose this application.

8 Dated: June 22, 2015

WALRAVEN & WESTERFELD LLP

9
 10 By: /s/ Bryan S. Westerfeld
 11 Bryan S. Westerfeld

12 Attorneys for Defendant UnitedHealth
 13 Group, Inc. and
 14 Defendants/Counterclaim Plaintiffs
 15 United Healthcare Services, Inc.,
 16 UnitedHealthcare Insurance Company
 17 and OptumInsight, Inc.

18 Dated: June 22, 2015

DORSEY & WHITNEY LLP

19
 20 By: /s/ R.J. Zayed
 21 R.J. Zayed

22 Attorneys for Defendant UnitedHealth
 23 Group, Inc. and
 24 Defendants/Counterclaim Plaintiffs
 25 United Healthcare Services, Inc.,
 26 UnitedHealthcare Insurance Company
 27 and OptumInsight, Inc.